arXiv:1211.5985v2 [gr-qc] 30 Nov 2012

Energy and momentum in multiple metric theories

Idan Talshir [*]

School of Physics, Tel Aviv University, Ramat Aviv 69978, Israel
Department of Physics, Ariel University Center of Samaria, Ariel 40700, Israel

Abstract

We derive the expressions for canonical energy, momentum, and angular momentum for multiple metric theories. We prove that although the metric fields are generally interacting, the total energy is the sum of conserved energies corresponding to each metric. A positive energy theorem is given as a result.

1 introduction

Energy, momentum and angular momentum are fundamental concepts in physics.

In the framework of special relativistic field theory, i.e. a non-dynamical Minkowski background, those conserved quantities are defined as the space integration on the currents corresponding to invariance of the action under time and space translations and rotations. The energy and momentum defined in this way are known as "canonical". An angular momentum can be derived from a symmetric energy momentum tensor. The canonical energy momentum tensor is not symmetric, but it can be symmetrized using the "Benlifante Procedure". There is another way for obtaining an energy momentum tensor, by varying the action with respect to the background metric, then estimate the outcome "on shell". The second procedure gives a symmetric tensor by definition, and can be shown to be equivalent to the canonical one.

The concept of energy and its conservation in general relativity was a matter of debate for a long time. It can be defined in a coordinate system which is asymptotically Minkowski, and has non-tensorial character under general coordinate transformation. Beside the canonical procedure , an energy momentum pseudo-tensor can be constructed from the field equation one gets by varying the action with respect to the metric. There are a few known procedures for doing so, and they do not give the same result, although "not very different".

Multiple metric theories are theories with more than one second-rank tensor, that, beside being a dynamical field, is used for raising and lowering indices, and for the construction of covariant differentiation (affine connection).

---

[*] E-mail: `talshir@post.tau.ac.il`

Recently they arose as a possible procedure for modifying general relativity. Milgrom suggested "Bimond"[3]- a theory with two metrics: One metric is coupled to matter, and so determines the motion of test particles, and the other, a "twin metric", is used to construct, with the ordinary metric, an interaction term. That interaction term becomes dominant at low accelerations (the MOND regime), and the theory can produce flat rotation curves with less amount of dark matter than General Relativity needs in order to explain the phenomena.

An expression for the energy of a multiple metric theory can be used for determining its stability and validity and for generating a dynamics for the system.

2 Total energy is separable

In the following we find an expression for the total energy-momentum pseudo-tensor of a multiple metric theory, and prove that it is the sum of energy-momentum pseudo-tensors; each one can be numerically determined by one metric, and formally is the same as we get from non-interacting general relativity (Einstein-Hilbert action)systems.

Without loss of generality, we take the number of metrics to be two. The proof is valid for any number of metrics .The action is:

$$S = \int L d^4x = \int (L_G + \hat{L}_G + L_{\text{int}}) d^4x \tag{1}$$

where the scalar densities in the parentheses are the Einstein-Hilbert scalar density for the metric $g_{\mu\nu}$:$L_G = R\sqrt{-g}$, a scalar density for the twin metric $\hat{g}_{\mu\nu}$: $\hat{L}_G = \hat{R}\sqrt{-\hat{g}}$, and an interaction term which depends on both metric and other fields and their derivatives : $L_{\text{int}}[g_{\mu\nu}; g_{\mu\nu,\rho}; \hat{g}_{\mu\nu}; g_{\mu\nu,\rho}; \psi; \psi_{,\rho}]$, where ψ symbolizes any other fields with any tensorial properties.

The total energy momentum pseudo-tensor for the system is the conserved current we get from invariance with respect to translation: This is the canonical energy momentum pseudo-tensor

$$\Theta^\alpha_\beta = -L\delta^\alpha_\beta + g_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L}{\partial g_{lm,\beta}} + \hat{g}_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\beta}} + \psi_{,\alpha}\frac{\partial L}{\partial \psi_{,\beta}} \tag{2}$$

Separating the Lagrangian density contributions

$$\begin{aligned}\Theta^\alpha_\beta = &\left(-L_G\delta^\alpha_\beta + g_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_G}{\partial g_{lm,\beta}}\right) + \left(-\hat{L}_G\delta^\alpha_\beta + \hat{g}_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial \hat{L}_G}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\beta}}\right) + \\ &+ \left(-L_{\text{int}}\delta^\alpha_\beta + g_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,\beta}} + \hat{g}_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\beta}} + \psi_{,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{,\beta}}\right)\end{aligned} \tag{3}$$

The first two terms on the right side of the equation are recognized as the gravity and twin gravity energy momentum pseudo tensors. Each one of them is functionally depends on one and only metric field, and its form does not depend on the interaction. It corresponds to the non-linear part (with respect to the deviations of the field from Minkowski metric) of the Einstein tensor. Now we would like to show that the Energy Momentum pseudo-vector that corresponds to the third term is equal to the energy momentum pseudo-vector corresponds to the sum of the contributions of the energy momentum pseudo-tensor minus the (twin) gravity energy-momentum pseudo-tensor as calculated from each field equation.

2.1 Interaction term is separable

We shall now prove that:

$$\int \left(-L_{\text{int}}\delta^0_\alpha + g_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,0}} + \hat{g}_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,0}} + \psi_{,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{,0}} \right) d^3x = \textstyle\int (\sqrt{-g}T^0_\alpha + \sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^0_\alpha) d^3x \tag{4}$$

where

$$T^\beta_\alpha \equiv g_{\alpha\nu}\frac{2}{\sqrt{-g}}\frac{\delta S_{\text{int}}}{\delta g_{\nu\beta}}; \hat{T}^\beta_\alpha \equiv \hat{g}_{\alpha\nu}\frac{2}{\sqrt{-\hat{g}}}\frac{\delta S_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{\nu\beta}}$$

We generalize Ohanian's proof [4], for more than one metric.
The variation of the scalar density L_{int} , under the coordinates transformation $\delta x^\mu = \xi^\mu(x)$, is:

$$\begin{aligned} &\delta L_{\text{int}} = L_{\text{int}}(x^\mu - \xi^\mu) \det \left(\frac{\partial x^\mu}{\partial (x^\nu + \xi^\nu)} \right) - L_{\text{int}}(x^\mu) = \\ &L_{\text{int}}(x^\mu - \xi^\mu)(\det \left(\frac{\partial (x^\nu + \xi^\nu)}{\partial x^\mu} \right))^{-1} - L_{\text{int}}(x^\mu) = \\ &(L_{\text{int}} - L_{\text{int},\mu}\xi^\mu)(1 - \xi^\mu_{,\mu}) - L_{\text{int}} = -(L_{\text{int}}\xi^\mu)_{,\mu} \end{aligned} \tag{5}$$

where the first equality is due to the tensorial properties of the scalar density, and the last two equalities are due to the smallness of ξ^μ.
On the other hand, the variation as a functional of metric and metric variations is:

$$\begin{aligned} \delta L_{\text{int}} = &\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{a\nu}}\delta g_{a\nu} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{a\nu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{a\nu,\mu}}\delta g_{\mu\nu,\mu} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{a\nu,\mu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu,\mu} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi}\delta\psi + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{,\mu}}\delta\psi_{,\mu} = \\ = &\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta g_{a\nu}}\delta g_{a\nu} + \frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu} + \frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \psi}\delta\psi + \left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{a\nu,\mu}}\delta g_{a\nu} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{a\nu,\mu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{,\mu}}\delta\psi \right)_{,\mu} \end{aligned} \tag{6}$$

From (5),(6) and the equation of motion $\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \psi} = 0$, we get

$$\left(-L_{\text{int}}\xi^\mu - \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{a\nu,\mu}}\delta g_{a\nu} - \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{a\nu,\mu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu} - \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{,\mu}}\delta\psi \right)_{,\mu} = \frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta g_{a\nu}}\delta g_{a\nu} + \frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu} \tag{7}$$

First, from the right hand side of (7) we obtain:

$$\begin{aligned}&\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta g_{a\nu}}\delta g_{a\nu}+\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu}=\\&=\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta g_{a\nu}}(-g_{a\alpha}\xi^{\alpha}_{,\nu}-g_{\alpha\nu}\xi^{\alpha}_{,a}-g_{a\nu,\alpha}\xi^{\alpha})+\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu}}(-\hat{g}_{a\alpha}\xi^{\alpha}_{,\nu}-\hat{g}_{\alpha\nu}\xi^{\alpha}_{,a}-\hat{g}_{a\nu,\alpha}\xi^{\alpha})=\\&=(\sqrt{-g}T^{a\nu}g_{a\alpha}\xi^{\alpha})_{,\nu}-\sqrt{-g}T^{a\nu}_{;\nu}g_{a\alpha}\xi^{\alpha}+(\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{a\nu}\hat{g}_{a\alpha}\xi^{\alpha})_{,\nu}-\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{a\nu}_{:\nu}\hat{g}_{a\alpha}\xi^{\alpha}\end{aligned} \tag{8}$$

where the ";" and ":" indicate covariant derivatives with respect to the metric and twin metric respectively. But

$$\sqrt{-g}T^{a\nu}_{;\nu}g_{a\alpha}+\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{a\nu}_{:\nu}\hat{g}_{a\alpha}=\sqrt{-g}T^{\nu}_{\alpha;\nu}+\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{\nu}_{\alpha:\nu}=0 \tag{9}$$

The above equation is true, because from a variation of the interaction action, a scalar, under coordinate transformation $x'^{\mu}=x^{\mu}+\xi^{\mu}$, we get:

$$\begin{aligned}\delta S_{\text{int}}&=\int d^4x\left(\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta g_{a\nu}}\delta g_{a\nu}+\frac{\delta L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu}}\delta \hat{g}_{a\nu}+\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\delta \psi}\delta\psi\right)=\\&=\int d^4x\left(-\tfrac{1}{2}\left(\sqrt{-g}T^{\mu\nu}\delta g_{\mu\nu}+\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{\mu\nu}\delta\hat{g}_{\mu\nu}\right)+0\right)=\\&=\int d^4x\tfrac{1}{2}\left(\sqrt{-g}T_{\mu\nu}\delta g^{\mu\nu}+\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}_{\mu\nu}\delta\hat{g}^{\mu\nu}\right)=0\end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

Substituting $\delta g^{\mu\nu}=\xi^{\mu;\nu}+\xi^{\nu;\mu}$ and $\delta\hat{g}^{\mu\nu}=\xi^{\mu:\nu}+\xi^{\nu:\mu}$, and making use of the symmetry of $T_{\mu\nu}$ and $\hat{T}_{\mu\nu}$, we have:

$$\begin{aligned}\delta S_{\text{int}}&=\int d^4x\left(\sqrt{-g}T_{\mu\nu}\xi^{\mu;\nu}+\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}_{\mu\nu}\xi^{\mu:\nu}\right)=0\\&=\int d^4x\left(\sqrt{-g}\left(\left(T^{\nu}_{\mu}\xi^{\mu}\right)_{;\nu}-T^{\nu}_{\mu;\nu}\xi^{\mu}\right)+\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\left(\left(\hat{T}^{\nu}_{\mu}\xi^{\mu}\right)_{:\nu}-\hat{T}^{\nu}_{\mu:\nu}\xi^{\mu}\right)\right)\end{aligned} \tag{11}$$

The first and third addends in the integrand can be written in the form

$$(T^{\nu}_{\mu}\xi^{\mu})_{;\nu}\sqrt{-g}=\frac{\partial}{\partial x^{\nu}}\left(\sqrt{-g}T^{\nu}_{\mu}\xi^{\mu}\right)\quad(\hat{T}^{\nu}_{\mu}\xi^{\mu})_{:\nu}\sqrt{-\hat{g}}=\frac{\partial}{\partial x^{\nu}}\left(\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{\nu}_{\mu}\xi^{\mu}\right)$$

and drop out as surface integrals. . The variations ξ^{μ} are arbitrary, and we therefore obtain (9).
The right side of (7) is now in the form:

$$((\sqrt{-g}T^{a\nu}g_{a\alpha}+\sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{a\nu}\hat{g}_{a\alpha}+)\xi^{\alpha})_{,\nu} \tag{12}$$

For the variations of the metrics in the left side of (7) we insert $\delta g_{lm}=-g_{lm,\mu}\xi^{\mu}-g_{l\mu}\xi^{\mu}_{,m}-g_{lm}\xi^{\mu}_{,\mu}$ and $\delta\hat{g}_{lm}=-\hat{g}_{lm,\mu}\xi^{\mu}-\hat{g}_{l\mu}\xi^{\mu}_{,m}-\hat{g}_{lm}\xi^{\mu}_{,\mu}$, and for the variation of the field ψ we use more general expression:

$$\delta\psi_A=-\psi_{A,\alpha}\xi^{\alpha}-\Lambda_{AB\alpha}{}^{\beta}\xi^{\alpha}_{,\beta}\psi_B$$

where capital letters A,B stands for all the tensorial indexes of the field ψ and $\Lambda_{AB\alpha}{}^{\beta}$ is a constant matrix, the exact form depends only on the tensorial properties of ψ. we get:

$$\left(-L_{\text{int}}\xi^{\mu} - \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,\mu}}\left(-g_{lm,\rho}\xi^{\rho} - g_{l\rho}\xi^{\rho}_{,m} - g_{lm}\xi^{\rho}_{,\rho}\right) - \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\mu}}\left(-\hat{g}_{lm,\rho}\xi^{\rho} - \hat{g}_{l\rho}\xi^{\rho}_{,m} - \hat{g}_{lm}\xi^{\rho}_{,\rho}\right)\right)_{,\mu} + \\ +\left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{A,\beta}}\left(\psi_{A,\alpha}\xi^{\alpha} + \Lambda_{AB\alpha}{}^{\beta}\xi^{\alpha}_{,\beta}\psi_B\right)\right)_{,\mu} = \left(\left(\sqrt{-g}T^{a\nu}g_{a\alpha} + \sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{a\nu}\hat{g}_{a\alpha}\right)\xi^{\alpha}\right)_{,\nu} \tag{13}$$

Collecting coefficients of first derivatives of ξ^{μ} from (13) , we get the equation:

$$-L_{\text{int}}\delta^{\beta}_{\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,\beta}}g_{lm,\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\beta}}\hat{g}_{lm,\alpha} + \psi_{A,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{A,\beta}} \\ +\left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{l\beta,\mu}}g_{l\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{l\beta,\mu}}\hat{g}_{l\alpha} + \left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,\mu}}g_{lm} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\mu}}\hat{g}_{lm}\right)\delta^{\beta}_{\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{A,\mu}}\Lambda_{AB\alpha}{}^{\beta}\xi^{\alpha}_{,\beta}\psi_B\right)_{,\mu} = \\ = \sqrt{-g}T^{a\beta}g_{a\alpha} + \sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{a\beta}\hat{g}_{a\alpha} \tag{14}$$

We would like to show that the third addend in the left hand side of (14) is a divergence of an anti-symmetric tensor. For this we collect the addends with the second derivatives of ξ^{μ} from (13). The equation is:

$$\left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{l\beta,\mu}}g_{l\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{l\beta,\mu}}\hat{g}_{l\alpha} + \left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,\mu}}g_{lm} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\mu}}\hat{g}_{lm}\right)\delta^{\beta}_{\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{A,\mu}}\Lambda_{AB\alpha}{}^{\beta}\xi^{\alpha}_{,\beta}\psi_B\right)\xi^{\alpha}_{,\beta,\mu} = 0 \tag{15}$$

Since $\xi^{\alpha}_{,\beta,\mu}$ is symmetric in β and μ, its coefficient should be anti-symmetric in the same indices to fulfil this equation. So:

$$\left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{l\beta,\mu}}g_{l\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{l\beta,\mu}}\hat{g}_{l\alpha} + \left(\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,\mu}}g_{lm} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\mu}}\hat{g}_{lm}\right)\delta^{\beta}_{\alpha} + \frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \psi_{A,\mu}}\Lambda_{AB\alpha}{}^{\beta}\xi^{\alpha}_{,\beta}\psi_B\right)_{,\mu} = W^{[\beta\mu]}_{\alpha,\mu}$$

Inserting this equation in (14), we get:

$$-L_{\text{int}}\delta^{\beta}_{\alpha} + g_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial g_{lm,\beta}} + \hat{g}_{lm,\alpha}\frac{\partial L_{\text{int}}}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\beta}} + W^{[\beta\rho]}_{\alpha,\rho} = \sqrt{-g}T^{a\beta}g_{a\alpha} + \sqrt{-\hat{g}}\hat{T}^{a\beta}\hat{g}_{a\alpha} \tag{16}$$

That means that the expression on the left side is different from the expression on the right side by a divergence of an anti-symmetric (pseudo-)tensor, and three-space integration on both sides would give the same result. Statement (4) is therefore proven.

2.2 Dependence on metrics is separable

Now, we want to clarify the fact that although the contribution to the energy momentum from the interaction term for each field equation seems to be functionally dependent on both metrics, then, from the field equations, we can see that they can be brought to a form which depends on only one metric. The right hand side of the equations

$$\frac{\delta S_{\text{int}}}{\delta g_{\mu\nu}} + \frac{\delta S_m}{\delta g_{\mu\nu}} = \frac{\delta S_G}{\delta g_{\mu\nu}} \qquad \frac{\delta S_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{\mu\nu}} = \frac{\delta \hat{S}_G}{\delta \hat{g}_{\mu\nu}}$$

is functionally depend on only one metric, so the left side is determined numerically by only one metric. The contribution from the gravity term (first two addends in (3)) is manifestly depends on one and the same metric, so the total energy momentum contribution from each field equation depends on only one metric. More specifically, we've seen that the (non-symmetric) energy momentum pseudo tensor is equivalent to (up to space integration)

$$\Theta^\mu_\nu =$$

$$\left(-L_G\delta^\mu_\nu + g_{lm,\nu}\frac{\partial L_G}{\partial g_{lm,\mu}} + 2g_{\alpha\nu}\frac{\delta(S_{\text{int}}+S_m)}{\delta g_{\alpha\mu}}\right) + \left(-\hat{L}_G\delta^\mu_\nu + \hat{g}_{lm,\nu}\frac{\partial \hat{L}_G}{\partial \hat{g}_{lm,\mu}} + 2\hat{g}_{\alpha\nu}\frac{\delta S_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{\alpha\mu}}\right)$$

Inserting

$$\frac{\delta(S_{\text{int}}+S_m)}{\delta g_{\alpha\mu}} = \frac{1}{32\pi G}\sqrt{-g}(R^{\alpha\mu} - \tfrac{1}{2}g^{\alpha\mu})$$
$$\frac{\delta S_{\text{int}}}{\delta \hat{g}_{\alpha\mu}} = \frac{1}{32\pi G}\sqrt{-\hat{g}}(\hat{R}^{\alpha\mu} - \tfrac{1}{2}\hat{g}^{\alpha\mu})$$

We get (up to three-space integration)

$$\Theta^\mu_\nu = \frac{1}{16\pi G}\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta}\left[\begin{array}{l}\dfrac{g_{\mu\sigma}}{\sqrt{-g}}\dfrac{\partial}{\partial x^\alpha}(-g)(g^{\nu\sigma}g^{\alpha\beta} - g^{\nu\alpha}g^{\sigma\beta}) + \\ \\ \dfrac{\hat{g}_{\mu\sigma}}{\sqrt{-\hat{g}}}\dfrac{\partial}{\partial x^\alpha}(-\hat{g})(\hat{g}^{\nu\sigma}\hat{g}^{\alpha\beta} - \hat{g}^{\nu\alpha}\hat{g}^{\sigma\beta})\end{array}\right] \tag{17}$$

Each one of the two addends is manifestly divergence free, because they are anti-symmetric in β and ν , so there are two conserved energy momentum (pseudo)vectors, each one numerically determined by one metric alone.
In fact, since we proved that the total energy-momentum pseudo-tensor is a sum of contributions that we get from general relativity actions for each metric, we can use a known result for the symmetric energy-momentum pseudo-tensor of general relativity, derived using the Belinfante procedure [5].
The symmetric energy-momentum pseudo-tensor for the multiple-metric system is then:

$$\Theta^{\mu\nu} = \frac{1}{16\pi G}\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\alpha}\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta}\left[\begin{array}{l}\sqrt{-g}(\eta^{\mu\nu}g^{\alpha\beta} - \eta^{\alpha\nu}g^{\mu\beta} + \eta^{\alpha\beta}g^{\mu\nu} - \eta^{\mu\beta}g^{\alpha\nu}) + \\ \sqrt{-\hat{g}}(\eta^{\mu\nu}\hat{g}^{\alpha\beta} - \eta^{\alpha\nu}\hat{g}^{\mu\beta} + \eta^{\alpha\beta}\hat{g}^{\mu\nu} - \eta^{\mu\beta}\hat{g}^{\alpha\nu})\end{array}\right] \tag{18}$$

With this symmetric pseudo-tensor the angular momentum of the multiple metric system can be well defined.

2.3 Boundary conditions

The energy momentum pseudo-tensor $\Theta^{\mu\nu}$ and the energy-momentum pseudo-vector $P^\mu = \int \Theta^{\mu 0} d^3x$ are Lorentz-covariant, i.e. are tensor and vector under Lorentz transformations of the coordinate system. In order to insure finiteness and meaning of the quantity P^μ we demand asymptotic behaviour from the interaction energy momentum tensors

$$T^\nu_\mu = \mathrm{O}(r^{-4}) \qquad \hat{T}^\nu_\mu = \mathrm{O}(r^{-4})$$

(in general relativity one can often assume an isolated system of masses so $T_\mu^\nu = 0$ outside a bounded region of space), and we'll assume asymptotic behaviour for the metric fields as $r \to \infty$:

$$g_{\mu\nu} \simeq \eta_{\mu\nu} + \mathrm{O}(r^{-1}) \quad , \quad \hat{g}_{\mu\nu} \simeq \eta_{\mu\nu} + \mathrm{O}(r^{-1})$$

so the gravity and twin gravity energy momentum pseudo tensors, which are quadratic in the derivatives of the metrics (first two terms in (3), resulting from the Einstein scalars, G and $\hat{G}$), go like r^{-4}.
The total energy momentum tensor, then, has the asymptotic behaviour $\Theta^{\mu\nu} = \mathrm{O}(r^{-4})$ so its integral over three-space converges, and has the same numeric value for every infinite spacelike hypersurface.
The energy momentum P^μ is also invariant under any coordinate transformation that tends to the identity at infinity, and preserving the boundary conditions above. This is because the energy momentum pseudo tensor can be written as a divergence of a third rank pseudo tensor, as we can see at (17) and (18). Taking, for example, the expression from (18), we can write this (pseudo-) tensor as a sum of anti-symmetric (pseudo-) tensors:

$$\Theta^{\mu\nu} = \frac{1}{16\pi G}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\alpha}\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta}\begin{bmatrix}\sqrt{-g}(\eta^{\mu\nu}g^{\alpha\beta} - \eta^{\alpha\nu}g^{\mu\beta}) + \\ \sqrt{-\hat{g}}(\eta^{\mu\nu}\hat{g}^{\alpha\beta} - \eta^{\alpha\nu}\hat{g}^{\mu\beta})\end{bmatrix} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta}\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\alpha}\begin{bmatrix}\sqrt{-g}(\eta^{\alpha\beta}g^{\mu\nu} - \eta^{\mu\beta}g^{\alpha\nu}) + \\ \sqrt{-\hat{g}}(\eta^{\alpha\beta}\hat{g}^{\mu\nu} - \eta^{\mu\beta}\hat{g}^{\alpha\nu})\end{bmatrix}\right) =$$

$$= \frac{1}{16\pi G}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\alpha}A^{\alpha\mu\nu} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta}B^{\beta\mu\nu}\right)$$

where $A^{\alpha\mu\nu} = -A^{\mu\alpha\nu}$ and $B^{\beta\mu\nu} = -B^{\mu\beta\nu}$ so its whole space integral reduces to an ordinary surface integral at infinity, which is not changed by the above coordinate transformation, i.e.

$$\int \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x^\alpha}A^{\alpha 0\nu} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta}B^{\beta 0\nu}\right)d^3x = \int \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x^i}A^{i0\nu} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x^i}B^{i0\nu}\right)_{i=1,2,3} d^3x$$

$$= \int \left(A^{i0\nu} + B^{i0\nu}\right) dS_i{}^{(2)}$$

3 Applications- positive energy theorem

We now prove that the total energy of a multi-metric system is not negative under specific conditions. This proof is a slight generalization of Witten's elegant proof ([6], [7]) of the positive energy theorem for general relativity. Defining the tetrads

$$g^{\mu\nu} = e_a^\mu \eta^{ab} e_b^\nu \qquad \hat{g}^{\mu\nu} = \hat{e}_a^\mu \eta^{ab} \hat{e}_b^\nu$$

(indices a, b, c in the tetrads are local) ,and imposing the conditions

$$e_0^0 = 1; \quad e^{00} = e_{00} = -1; \quad e_0^\alpha = e_0^i = 0$$

.
$(i = 1, 2, 3)$, Connection coefficients

$$\omega_{\mu,ab} = \tfrac{1}{2}e_\mu^c(\Omega_{cab} - \Omega_{abc} - \Omega_{bca}) \qquad \Omega_{cab} = e_{\nu c}(e_a^\mu \partial_\mu e_b^\nu - e_b^\mu \partial_\mu e_a^\nu)$$
$$\hat{\omega}_{\mu,ab} = \tfrac{1}{2}\hat{e}_\mu^c(\hat{\Omega}_{cab} - \hat{\Omega}_{abc} - \hat{\Omega}_{bca}) \qquad \hat{\Omega}_{cab} = \hat{e}_{\nu c}(\hat{e}_a^\mu \partial_\mu \hat{e}_b^\nu - \hat{e}_b^\mu \partial_\mu \hat{e}_a^\nu)$$

and three-dimensional Dirac operators

$$D = e^i_a \gamma^a \nabla_i \quad \hat{D} = \hat{e}^i_a \gamma^\alpha \hat{\nabla}_i$$

$$\nabla_\mu = \partial_\mu + \tfrac{1}{8}\omega_{\mu,ab}[\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \quad \hat{\nabla}_\mu = \partial_\mu + \tfrac{1}{8}\hat{\omega}_{\mu,ab}[\gamma^a, \gamma^b]$$

Ordinary matter fields in general relativity fulfil the "positivity condition" for their energy momentum tensor. If the condition holds for each field equation in a multiple metric theory, then there is a unique solution for the Dirac equations

$$D\psi = 0 \quad \hat{D}\hat{\psi} = 0$$

with asymptotic behaviour

$$\begin{aligned} \psi &= \psi_0 + O\left(\frac{1}{r}\right) \quad \partial_\mu \psi = O\left(\frac{1}{r^{1+\alpha}}\right) \quad \alpha > \tfrac{1}{2} \\ \hat{\psi} &= \hat{\psi}_0 + O\left(\frac{1}{r}\right) \quad \partial_\mu \hat{\psi} = O\left(\frac{1}{r^{1+\hat{\alpha}}}\right) \quad \hat{\alpha} > \tfrac{1}{2} \end{aligned}$$

for every constant spinors $\psi_0, \hat{\psi}_0$.
The following equations hold:

$$\int e\left[\tfrac{1}{2}\psi^*(T_{00} + T_{0k}e^k_\alpha \gamma^0 \gamma^\alpha)\psi + (\nabla_i \psi)^*(\nabla^i \psi)\right] d^3x = \tfrac{1}{4}(E(\psi_0^* \psi_0) + P_\alpha(\psi_0^* \gamma^0 \gamma^\alpha \psi_0))$$

$$\int \hat{e}\left[\tfrac{1}{2}\hat{\psi}^*(\hat{T}_{00} + \hat{T}_{0k}e^k_\alpha \gamma^0 \gamma^\alpha)\hat{\psi} + (\nabla_i \hat{\psi})^*(\nabla^i \hat{\psi})\right] d^3x = \tfrac{1}{4}(\hat{E}(\hat{\psi}_0^* \hat{\psi}_0) + P_\alpha(\hat{\psi}_0^* \gamma^0 \gamma^\alpha \hat{\psi}_0)) \tag{19}$$

where

$$E + \hat{E} = \int \Theta^0_0 d^3x \qquad P_\alpha + \hat{P}_\alpha = \int \Theta^0_\alpha d^3x \tag{20}$$

from (19) we have

$$E \geq |P_\alpha| \quad \hat{E} \geq \left|\hat{P}_\alpha\right| \tag{21}$$

So total energy is not negative and the Lorentz-vector

$$\int \Theta^0_\mu d^3x$$

is time-like.
That the total energy is zero if both metrics are flat, can be seen immediately by placing $\eta_{\mu\nu}$ in (18).
To prove that the total energy is zero only if all energy momentum tensors are zero and both metrics are flat, we use (21) to note that if $E, \hat{E} = 0$ then $P_\alpha, \hat{P}_\alpha = 0$ Placing these in (20) we get the equations

$$\nabla_i \psi = 0 \quad \nabla_i \hat{\psi} = 0 \tag{22}$$

and

$$\psi^*(T_{00} + T_{0k}e^k_\alpha \gamma^0 \gamma^\alpha)\psi = 0 \quad \hat{\psi}^*(\hat{T}_{00} + \hat{T}_{0k}\hat{e}^k_\alpha \gamma^0 \gamma^\alpha)\hat{\psi} = 0 \tag{23}$$

Using (22) we can show than the curvature tensors on some initial surface$x^0 = 0$ are zero.

$$R_{ikab} = 0 \quad \hat{R}_{ikab} = 0 \tag{24}$$

Using (23) we can show that

$$T_{00} = 0 \quad \hat{T}_{00} = 0 \tag{25}$$

From (25) and the "positivity condition" we get $T_{\mu\nu} = 0 \;\; \hat{T}_{\mu\nu} = 0$, so $R_{\mu\nu} = 0 \;\; \hat{R}_{\mu\nu} = 0$. Using this and (24) we get $R_{0k0a} = 0 \quad \hat{R}_{0k0a} = 0$, so altogether we get

$$R_{\mu\nu ab} = 0 \quad \hat{R}_{\mu\nu ab} = 0$$

on the surface $x^0 = 0$

The energies $E, \hat{E}$ are conserved, i.e. constant in time, so the above proof is valid for every surface x^0, so the curvature tensors are zero in all points, and both metrics are flat. This completes the proof that the total energy is positive for every non-trivial configuration in multi-metric theories.

4 Hamiltonian formalism

The above formalism can be used in formulating first order equations for the metric fields, with energy and momentum being the generators of time and space translations.

To apply the Hamiltonian formalism in relativistic field theory, we need to separate the spacetime into space + time, and to distinguish the time coordinate from the other coordinates. This separation was done in previous sections, when we chose the boundary conditions for the metric.

To construct the Hamiltonian, we take the expression for energy and rephrase it without time derivatives of the fields. (as is done in [7] for general relativity) We get:

$$H_{total} = H + \hat{H} =$$

$$= \int \Big(q^{ik} q^{lm} (\Pi_{il}\Pi_{km} - \Pi_{ik}\Pi_{lm}) + Q + T_{00} + \hat{q}^{ik}\hat{q}^{lm} (\hat{\Pi}_{il}\hat{\Pi}_{km} - \hat{\Pi}_{ik}\hat{\Pi}_{lm}) + \hat{Q} + \hat{T}_{00} \Big) d^3x$$

where

$$q^{ik} = h^{0i}h^{0k} - h^{00}h^{ik}, \qquad \Pi_{ik} = \frac{1}{h^{00}}\Gamma^0_{ik} \qquad h^{\mu\nu} = \sqrt{-g}g^{\mu\nu}$$

,

$$Q = -\tfrac{1}{2} q^{ik} \partial_i \ln\gamma \partial_k \ln\gamma - \tfrac{1}{2} q_{ik} \partial_l q^{im} \partial_m q^{kl} - \tfrac{1}{4} q^{ik} \partial_i q_{lm} \partial_k q^{lm}$$

and $\gamma = \det(g_{ik})$. Expressions for $\hat{q}^{ik}, \hat{\Pi}_{ik}, \hat{Q}$ are obtained by placing a "hat" over all the quantities above.

If the interaction energy densities T_{00} and $\hat{T}_{00}$ are formulated with the canonical coordinates (q, Π) and with no time components or time derivative of the fields, then we have a generalized Hamiltonian.

The multi-metric theory,like Einstein's general relativity, is constrained, and its naive Hamiltonian formulation, with Legendre transform and the total energy expression, must be modified to take into account these constraints. This is done by replacing Poisson brackets with Dirac brackets [8].

The equations of motion for the metric are:

$$\frac{d}{dt}q^{ik} = \{q^{ik}, H_{total}\}_{DB} = \{q^{ik}, H_{total}\}_{PB} + \{q^{ik}, \phi_a\}_{PB} M^{-1} \{\phi_b, q^{ik}\}_{PB}$$

$$\frac{d}{dt}\hat{q}^{ik} = \{\hat{q}^{ik}, H_{total}\}_{DB} = \{\hat{q}^{ik}, H_{total}\}_{PB} + \{\hat{q}^{ik}, \phi_a\}_{PB} M^{-1} \{\phi_b, \hat{q}^{ik}\}_{PB}$$

Where the Poisson brackets of any two fields are defined by:

$$\{A, B\}_{PB} \equiv \int \left(\frac{\delta A}{\delta q^{ik}} \frac{\delta B}{\delta \Pi_{ik}} - \frac{\delta B}{\delta q^{ik}} \frac{\delta A}{\delta \Pi_{ik}} \right) d^3x$$

and the matrix M_{ab}

$$M_{ab} \equiv \left\{ \tilde{\phi}_a, \tilde{\phi}_b \right\}_{PB}$$

where the $\tilde{\phi}_a$ are the second-class constrains of the theory.

5 Summary

We saw that energy, momentum and angular momentum of a multi-metric theory with interaction can be well defined and divided into independently conserved quantities, where each one depends numerically on one metric. This was applied in a relatively easy generalization of positive energy theorem. A further important application is an Hamlitonian frame work for the multi-metric theories.

Acknowledgements

I want to thank Lawrence P. Horwitz and Marcelo Schiffer for usefull comments, directions, and interesting discussions. I gratefully acknowledge financial support from Ariel University Center.

References

[1] Weinberg, Steven, *Gravitation and Cosmology: Principles and Applications of the General Theory of Relativity*

[2] L.D. Landau, E.M. Lifshitz, *The Classical Theory of Fields, Fourth Edition: Volume 2 (Course of Theoretical Physics Series)*

[3] Milgrom, Mordehai, *Bimetric MOND gravity*, Physical Review D, vol. 80, Issue 12, id. 123536

[4] Hans C.Ohanian, *The Energy-Momentum Tensor in General Relativity and in Alternative Theories of Gravitation, and the Gravitational vs. Inertial Mass*, arXiv:1010.5557.

[5] Dongsu Bak, D. Cangemi, R. Jackiw, *Energy-Momentum Conservation in General Relativity*, Phys.Rev. D49 (1994) 5173-5181; Erratum-ibid. D52 (1995) 3753

[6] Edward Witten, *A new proof of the positive energy theorem*, Comm. Math. Phys. Volume 80, Number 3 (1981), 381-402.

[7] Lyudvig D Faddeev, *The energy problem in Einstein's theory of gravitation (Dedicated to the memory of V. A. Fock)*, Soviet Physics Uspekhi (1982), 25(3):130.

[8] P. A. M. Dirac, *Generalized Hamiltonian Dynamics*, Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series A, Mathematical and Physical Sciences Vol. 246, No. 1246 (Aug. 19, 1958), pp. 326-332